

The Save Bhutto Movement (1977-1979) through the Prism of Reflections of Backfire Tactics

Muhammad Aslam*
Muhammad Rumman Khan**

ABSTRACT

The hanging of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto — the Pakistan’s most prominent politician and the founder of Pakistan Peoples’ Party (PPP) — was an earth shattering incident. The PPP tried its best to save his life and opted every way to avert this happening. They launched a ‘Safe Bhutto Movement’ through the reflections of non-violence and tactics of backfire. This paper studies as how far the resistance to save Bhutto from being hanged was a non-violent action in terms of tactics and strategies of non-violence theory. In the ‘Save Bhutto Movement,’ the connection between theory and practice of non-violence is largely missing. No scholar of this domain has still connected theory of non-violence with this movement. In this article, an attempt is made to place the concepts of non-violence on a proper place. It also tries to find out reflections of backfire tactics. This research work covers two aspects of non-violence theory: the first aspect discusses as how the activists of ‘Save Bhutto Movement’ organized the techniques of non-violence to develop pressure on Zia government for the release of Bhutto? In the

* Lecturer Degree College Shahdadtot.

** MSC in History, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad.

second aspect, it aims to see as how General Zia used tactics of backfire to defuse the movement against his government? Main concern is to analyse the Save Bhutto Movement through the prism of Brian Martin's developed theoretical paradigm.

Introduction

The history of Pakistan is full of movements for the restoration of democracy as the authoritarian rule has visited the country from time to time. Among all authoritarian regimes, General Zia-ul-Haq's military government was an enduring era (1977-1988). Historians like Hassan Askari Rizvi,¹ Muhammad Waseem,² Saeed Shafqat,³ Ilyas Shakir,⁴ Mushahid Husain,⁵ Abdul Qadir Mushtaq,⁶ Shahid Javed Burki,⁷ believe that Zia regime was the darkest and suppressive in terms of strategies and space for political rivals.

The civilian government of Bhutto held elections in the first week of March 1977. However, the Pakistan National Alliance (PNA) accused Bhutto of rigging elections (PNA). Resultantly, unrest in the shape of mass mobilization against Bhutto took place and it led military dictator Zia to intervene in politics.⁸ He arrested Bhutto and eventually imposed

-
- 1 Hassan Askari Rizvi, *The Military and Politics in Pakistan 1947-1997* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 2000).
 - 2 Muhammad Waseem, *Pakistan Under Martial Law 1977-1985* (Lahore: Vanguard Book (Pvt) Ltd, 1987).
 - 3 Saeed Shafqat, *Civil-Military Relations in Pakistan from Zulfikar Ali Bhutto to Benazir Bhutto* (Colorado: West View Press, 1999).
 - 4 Ilyas Shakir, *MRD: Kamyabian aur Nakamian* [Urdu: MRD: Successes and Failures] (Karachi: Shabal Publications, 1985).
 - 5 Mushahid Husain, *Pakistan's Politics: The Zia Years* (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1990).
 - 6 Abdul Qadir Mushtaq, "Movement for the Restoration of Democracy (MRD)", *Journal of Human Resources and Leadership* (2013): 111-126.
 - 7 Shahid Javed Burki, *Pakistan Under the Military, Eleven Years of Zia-ul-Haq* (Francisco: West View Press, 1991).
 - 8 Farkhanda Bukhari, *Ye Bazi Ishq Ki Bazi hai* [Urdu: It is the Matter of Intense Love] (Lahore: Sang-i-Meel Publications, 2012), 65-66.

Martial Law in the country on July 5, 1977.⁹ The PPP and other progressive and regional political parties such as the Sindh Awami Tahreek, the Quami Mahaz-i-Azadi, the Jamiat-i-Ulema-i-Islam and the Pakistan Mazdoor Kisan Party condemned the unconstitutional policies against the politicians of Pakistan.¹⁰

The political forces of Pakistan not only rejected military dictatorship but also demanded the revival of peoples' power in the country. In this connection, the PPP in association with the Sindh Awami Tahreek started movement for the release of Bhutto and other political leaders.¹¹ This movement was called by Rasool Bakhsh Palejo as "*Bhutto Bachayio Tahreek*" [Sindhi: the Save Bhutto Movement],¹² whereas Ghulam Murtaza Sayed (G. M. Sayed) had termed it *Kafan Chorani Ji Tahreek* [Sindhi: *the struggler of power hungry masses*].¹³

Non-violent Action

The peoples' power and civil resistance are used as alternative terms for non-violent action. Mohan Das Karmchand Gandhi used the term *Satyagraha* for his unarmed movements in South Africa and United India.¹⁴ Gene Sharp a pragmatic non-violent theorist termed unarmed movement as non-violent action instead of non-violence. The theorist has also discovered 198 methods of non-violence such as protests, marches, rallies, strikes, hunger strikes, processions, sit-ins, and demonstrations. Thus, non-violence and non-violent action are considered as

9 Burki, *Pakistan Under the Military*.

10 Mushtaq, "Movement for the Restoration of Democracy (MRD),".

11 Faiz Khoso, *Kare Kakkar Heth Mu Jharrendea Chaddiya: Tarikhee Halchal MRD [Sindhi: Fighting Sprit under Dark Cloud: Historical Movement MRD]* (Hyderabad: My Publications, 2013), 37.

12 Khoso, "*Kare Kakkar Heth Mu'n Jharrendea Chaddiya*, 39.

13 Bhira Nazeer Deenari, Interview, April 12, 2016, *Mehboob Jo Bagalo Village Taluka Miro Khan*.

14 Adam Roberts and Timothy Garton Ash, *Civil Resistance and Power Politics: The Experience of Non-violent Action from Gandhi to Present* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), 1.

same sides of one coin.¹⁵ According to Gandhi, non-violence does not carry violent activities such as beating, shootings, killings and injuries; it works to gain aims and objectives without harming political rivalries and it is far from violence.¹⁶ Sharp explains that if a movement carries a few methods of non-violent action such movement can be called as non-violent action in terms of techniques of non-violence theory.¹⁷

People power is also used as another alternative for non-violent action. The term was constructed after the unarmed struggle in Philippines which resulted in the end of ruler Ferdinand Marcos's dictatorial and unconstitutional regime in 1986.¹⁸ It gained popularity in the world in post-peaceful revolution era in Philippines. In the Philippine movement, techniques of non-violence such as protests, sit-ins, strikes and demonstrations were used to generate pressure on government. In this connection, Adam Roberts and Timothy Garton Ash recommend the term people power as a synonym of non-violent action in terms of tactics of non-violence theory.¹⁹

Tactics of Backfire

Covering-up the action is a method of backfire that is used by government or dictators to reduce public reaction that takes place during the attacks against non-violent activists. This tactic of backfire hides the factual information of government assaults on peaceful protesters from public

15 Gene Sharp, *The Politics of Non-Violent Action* (Boston: Porter Sargent Publication, 1973).

16 Mahatma Gandhi, *Non-violent Resistance (Satyagraha)* (New York: Schocken Books, 1916).

17 Gene Sharp, *Social Power and political Freedom* (Boston: Porter Sargent Publishers, 1980).

18 Kurt Schock, *Unarmed Insurrections: People Power Movements in Non-democracies* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), 1-2.

19 Roberts and Ash, *Civil Resistance and Power Politics*, 1-3.

while stopping media coverage.²⁰ The devaluation of targets is a technique of backfire to diffuse outrage. Dictators try to devalue opponents while labelling them anarchists, separatists and terrorists.²¹ If the traitor of a country is arrested or assaulted, public does not react. In a similar vein, if the lover of a country is arrested, there would be massive public reaction against the government.²²

Misinterpretation is a process of exploiting the fact about the attacks of government on unarmed movement leaders.²³ During peaceful protests, non-violent activists are assaulted by the governments. The police beat protesters brutally. However, conflicting stories are spread among public to diffuse anti-government campaigns. The actual report of injuries and casualties is usually misinterpreted.²⁴ Dictators use the official channels such as courts, expert panels and procedures to justify their unconstitutional governments. The use of official channels shows the illusion of justice and fair treatment when governments are powerful. Mostly, public has trust on official channels.²⁵ The last tactics of backfire is intimidation or reward. It is a kind of threat which is also used by government to discourage public participation in a movement against the government.²⁶

Public Reaction on the Arrest of Bhutto

20 Brian Martin. How nonviolence works. *Borderlands e-journal*, Vol. 4, No. 3, 2005; reprinted in Charles P. Weibel and Jørgen Johansen (eds.), *Peace and Conflict Studies: A Reader* (London: Routledge, 2012), 289-298.

21 Brian Martin. *Nonviolence Unbound* (Sparsnäs, Sweden: Irene Publishing, 2015), 58.

22 Brian Martin. *Backfire manual: tactics against injustice* (Sparsnäs, Sweden: Irene Publishing, 2012), 9.

23 Brian Martin. "Paths to social change: conventional politics, violence and nonviolence". In: Ralph Summy (ed.), *Nonviolent Alternatives for Social Change*, in *Encyclopedia of Life Support Systems (EOLSS)*, developed under the auspices of the UNESCO (Oxford: Eolss Publishers, <http://www.eolss.net>, 2006.

24 Brian Martin and Iain Murray, "The Parkin backfire", *Social Alternatives* 24, no. 3, 2005: 46-49.

25 Martin, *Non-violence Unbound*, 59.

26 Martin and Murray, "The Parkin Backfire".

The Save Bhutto Movement was a reaction of the arrest of Bhutto. Furthermore, the imposition of Martial Law and arrest of politicians were also perceived as unjust. After the declaration of military rule in Pakistan, General Zia banned political parties in opposition to his unconstitutional government.²⁷ Resultantly, the political leadership perceived unconstitutional policies of Zia government as unjust and outrage led to mass mobilization against the military regime.²⁸

The military regime also knew that public reaction would come from the followers of Bhutto, party workers and leaders. It therefore began fostering judiciary in order to justify Bhutto's arrest.²⁹ The Chief Justices Provincial High Courts were given the governorships of provinces. Moreover, Judges who did not oblige either were removed or compelled to take retirements.³⁰

Justice Khuwaja Muhammad Ahmed Samadani of Lahore High Court endorsed the bail of Bhutto. Consequently, Justice Samadani was removed from the bench of five judges who were hearing the case against Bhutto. Eventually, bail was revoked by newly constituted bench of five judges except Samadani. A newly constituted bench began the trial against Bhutto on the charge of murder conspiracy of his political opponent Muhammad Ahmad Khan Kusori.³¹

Benazir Bhutto explained that her father was placed in different jails of Pakistan.³² Firstly, he was kept in the central Jail Sukkur. Secondly, he was transferred to the central Jail

27 Daily Jang, July 7, 1977.

28 Rizvi, *The Military and Politics in Pakistan 1947-1997*.

29 K. M. Arif, *Khaki Shadows, Pakistan 1947-1997* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2001).

30 Shafqat, *Civil-Military Relations in Pakistan*, 193.

31 Muhammad Waseem, *Politics and State in Pakistan* (Islamabad: NIHCR, 2007), 354.

32 Muhammad Ali Sheikh, *Benazir Bhutto Jedojehad Jee Aalamat [Sindhi: Benazir Bhutto: Icon of Struggle]* (Karachi: Sindhica Academy, 2001).

Karachi and then, he was put in the central Jail Lahore. It was risky for the government to let public know where Bhutto was actually jailed.³³ Apart, General Khalid Mehmood Arif in his book also supported allegation that the actual place of imprisonment of Bhutto was kept secret.³⁴ In the inception, Bhutto was arrested on the charge of planning civil war. However, the government neither could recover weapons from the workers of PPP nor got any proof to support this charge.³⁵

Zia government intimidated Masud Muhmud, Director General Federal Security Force, to confess the involvement of Bhutto in the murder of Kasuri. Mr. Masud Muhmud was a civil servant; he was arrested, victimized, and harmed physically as well as mentally to testify against Bhutto.³⁶ After extensive pressure and mental torture of two months, he agreed to testify against Bhutto and other involved actors.³⁷ Eventually, Bhutto was arrested with the consultation of the Ministry of Interior once again.³⁸ Moreover, Masud Muhmud accepted his involvement in the murder of Bhutto's political rival Muhammad Khan Kasuri on the condition that he would be set free from all the charges. In this connection, he testified against Bhutto in the court which led the justification of Bhutto's arrest.³⁹

After the arrest of Bhutto, Begum Nusrat Bhutto with the assistance of Benazir Bhutto, assumed the control of PPP. She struggled every inch to set Bhutto free from

33 Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of the East: An Autobiography* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1989), 111.

34 Arif, *Khaki Shadows, Pakistan 1947-1997*.

35 Sheikh, *Benazir Bhutto Jedojehad Jee Aalamat*.

36 Pro.Ghafoor Ahmed, *Phir Marshal Law Agya* [Urdu: Matial Law Comes Again] (Lahore: Jang Publishers), 260.

37 Benazir Bhutto, *Daughter of Destiny: An Autobiography* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1988), 116-119.

38 Roedad Khan, *Pakistan —A Dream Gone Sour* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1989), 66.

39 Khoso, "Kare Kakkar Heth Mu'n Jharrendea Chaddiya, 45.

imprisonment and save the PPP from decline.⁴⁰ Benazir Bhutto also came forward with a motive to get the support of civil society, labourers, lawyers, students and journalists.⁴¹ With the public support, the women of Bhutto family organized demonstrations in Faisalabad where Benazir Bhutto expressed her painful feelings over the arrest of her father and on the imposition of military rule in the country.⁴² Consequently, the government threatened Benazir Bhutto to refrain from speaking against the armed forces of Pakistan. Finally, Zia government arrested her on the charge of spreading anarchy in the country.⁴³

The women of Bhutto family tried to unite party workers under strong agenda and convinced them to participate in the Save Bhutto Struggle. As a result, mass pressure developed on military government. Resultantly, General Zia announced local body elections.⁴⁴ On August 3, 1977, the PPP leadership called for a meeting where decision regarding election boycott was taken. The leadership also decided to support opponents of military government in local body elections.⁴⁵ The PPP continued the non-violent resistance to military rule and it also organized a public procession at Nishtar Park Karachi on September 28, 1977 where restoration of democracy and release of Bhutto was strongly demanded.⁴⁶

In the last week of February 1978, the government organized a friendly cricket match at Gaddafi Stadium

40 Sheikh, *Benazir Bhutto Jedojehad Jee Aalamat*.

41 Bhutto, *Daughter of Destiny*, 120.

42 Bhutto, *Daughter of Destiny*, 117.

43 Khoso, "Kare Kakkar Heth Mu'n Jharrendea Chaddiya", 45. And also; see Sheikh, *Benazir Bhutto Jedojehad Jee Aalamat*.

44 Amir Ahmed Khuhro and Ali Nawaz Soomro, "The Role of Benazir Bhutto in the Movement for the Restoration of Democracy," *International Journal of Social Science and Humanity*, 3, No. 3, 2013.

45 *Daily Jang*, 04 August 1977.

46 *Daily Musawat*, September 29, 1977.

Lahore to show the impression of peace in Pakistan.⁴⁷ Nusrat Bhutto got opportunity to expose the unconstitutional government of Zia before the crowd of more than sixty thousand people including national and international media.⁴⁸ She was watching match from the very important portion of stadium. During the match, Begum Nusrat Bhutto started raising the slogans of *Jiye Bhutto* [Urdu: Long Live Bhutto] *Bhutto Ko Azad Karo* [Urdu: Release Bhutto].⁴⁹ The police used *lathi* charge to silence her. Despite injuries, she exposed dictatorial nature of the Zia government.⁵⁰

Nusrat Bhutto knew that official channels would be used to justify her husband's unlawful arrest.⁵¹ Thus, to counter it, she directed her party workers to form Patriot Democratic Lawyers Alliance in Lahore. She hoped that lawyers' alliance would help in countering official channels.⁵² Apart, a resolution was brought by the lawyers in support of Bhutto as it was demanded that he should be treated as political victim instead of a criminal.⁵³ Lawyers' resolution also showed impression that the Lahore High Court was working as a government missionary in Z. A. Bhutto case.⁵⁴

Non-violent Action on Course

In the inception of Martial Law, the PPP was a major political party which peacefully resisted the military government. Shipyard Labourers also condemned the arrest of Bhutto. They also called for strikes in the last week of November

47 Qamar Bhatti, *MRD Tahreek* [Urdu: MRD Movement] (Hyderabad: Publisher Dahar Sindhi, 1984).

48 Husain, *Pakistan's Politics*, 111.

49 Sheikh, *Benazir Bhutto Jedojehad Jee Aalamat*.

50 Farkhanda Bukhari, *Ye Bazi Ishq Ki Bazi hai* [Urdu: This bet is the bet of love] (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 2012), 65-66.

51 Husain, *Pakistan's Politics*, 112.

52 Arif, *Khaki Shadows, Pakistan 1947-1997*, 193. And also see Khan, *Pakistan-A Dream Gone Sour*, 67.

53 Aslam Gordaspuri, *Shaheed Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Ke Dastan-i-Hayat Aur Pakistan Peoples' Party* [Urdu: The Biography of Martyr Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and Pakistan Peoples' Party] (Lahore: Fiction House, 2010), 372-375.

54 Husain, *Pakistan's Politics*, 112.

1978 in Karachi. More than twenty textile mills in the country were closed down resulting in more than ten thousand labourers unemployed. Despite losing jobs, labourers continued supporting the Save Bhutto Movement.⁵⁵ Furthermore, the labour union of Pakistan International Airlines (PIA) protested against the government and ensured their support.⁵⁶ In protest against the imposition of Martial Law, the Advocate General of Sindh and Punjab resigned from their offices and many others left jobs when the Lahore High Court declared the sentence of Z. A. Bhutto.⁵⁷

Women workers and prisoners also supported Bhutto by raising the slogans of *Jeay Bhutto*.⁵⁸ The scores of women in Sindh province protested on the roads of Hyderabad under the leadership of Zarina Baloch where they offered bangles to policemen. Offering bangles to males is considered a matter of shame and the sign of femininity in Pakistani society.⁵⁹ As a consequence, the government arrested about three hundred women workers and sent them to different jails of Hyderabad city.⁶⁰

The farmers of Sindh province also supported the Save Bhutto Movement due to Bhutto's land reforms policy whereas military government decried these reforms.⁶¹ The farmers of Naseerabad (an area of rural Sindh situated in Kamber Shahdadt district) got lands and others also got benefits from this policy. However, the government seized the land which was given in land reforms.⁶² The unconstitutional policies of the government were condemned

55 Mahmood Mirza, *Aaj Ka Sindh Pakistan ke Yukjehti ke Masai* [Urdu: Today's Sindh: Problems of Solidarity in Pakistan] (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1986), 53.

56 Moulana Bakhsh Chandio, Interview, January 2017, Hyderabad. And also see Sheikh, *Benazir Bhutto Jedojehad Jee Aalamat*.

57 *Daily Jang*, July 8, 1977.

58 Nuzhat Pathan, *Interview*, February 26, 2017. Hyderabad.

59 Fayaz Hussain Qadiri, *Interview*, April 15, 2016. Jamshoro.

60 *Kawish Mag* (Weekly), April 20, 2014.

61 Sono Khan Chandio, *Interview*, April 29, 2016. Dadu.

62 *Kawish Mag* (Weekly), April 20, 2014.

by the SAT. Later, the SAT also strengthened the hands of PPP in MRD against the military regime.⁶³

In opposition to the death sentence of Bhutto, hundreds of male and female workers of the SAT protested in Dadu, Larkana and Hyderabad.⁶⁴ As a consequence, the founding leader of SAT Rasool Bakhsh Palejo, along with many workers, was imprisoned.⁶⁵ In reaction from Punjab, Mukhtiar Rana, Mustafa Khar, Jahangeer Badar and other political workers of the the PPP condemned the death sentence of Bhutto.⁶⁶

The followers of Bhutto sacrificed their lives; the likes of Abdul Aziz from Sukkur had burnt himself.⁶⁷ However, extreme forms of non-violent action such as self-suffering and resignation from jobs did not melt Zia and he continued to suppress the supporters of Bhutto.

Bhutto Day Celebration in Amsterdam Netherland

The Black Day and other specific Day observations are considered as methods of non-violence. In this case, non-violent activists decided to observe the Bhutto Day.⁶⁸ During the period of Bhutto's trial, Shah Nawaz Bhutto and Mir Murtaza Bhutto expanded their non-violent campaign at international level to save their father's life whereas on March 18, 1978, the decision of death sentence to Bhutto by the Supreme Court of Pakistan was finally announced.⁶⁹ Despite the announcement, Bhutto brothers made every

63 Ustad Shaman Ali Khokhar, *Interview*, April 2016. Jacobabad. And also see *Kawish Mag* (Weekly), April 20, 2014.

64 Khoso, *Kari Kakar Haith Mon Jhaidaindai Chadiya* .And also see, *Kawish Mag* (Weekly), April 20, 2014.

65 Altaf Hussain Qadiri, *Interview*, April 20, 2016. Shahdadkot. See Jail Diary of Rasool Bakhsh Paleejo's *Kot Lakhpatt Jail Diary*.

66 Mushahid Hussain's *Interview* on MRD Movement, *Kawish News Channel*, April 15, 2014.

67 Moola Bakhsh Chandio, *Jail Diary Jindan Jo Qaidi*. And also see, *Kawish Mag* (Weekly) May 04, 2014.

68 Gene Sharp, *The Politics of Non-violent Action* (New York: Porter Sargent Publishers, 1974).

69 Daily *Jang*, March 19, 1977. Daily *Nawai-Waqt*, March 19, 1977.

effort to save Bhutto. For it, they travelled to Iran, Libya, UAE and USA where they held meetings with the international community to develop pressure on General Zia.⁷⁰ They also planned to call for an international convention on April 7, 1979 to unfold faults and imperfections in the decision of worthy Supreme Court of Pakistan.⁷¹ However, planned international convention was a delayed step and Bhutto was sent to gallows on April 4, 1979.⁷²

After the death of Bhutto, overseas followers of the PPP observed Bhutto Day in Amsterdam Netherland on August 19, 1979 that aimed at developing international pressure on the authoritarian government of Zia for the restoration of democracy in Pakistan.⁷³ However, the PPP could not get strong response from international community.

Why Save Bhutto Struggle Failed?

The leadership of Save Bhutto Movement failed to chart out the objectives of struggle because of factional groups in the party which cropped up after the arrest of Bhutto.⁷⁴ For example, one landlord did not sit with another landlord of his native province, as was the case with Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi, Mumtaz Bhutto and Abdul Hafeez Pirzada of Sindh province.⁷⁵ They were in conflict over the headship of PPP.⁷⁶ Kausar Niazi, was also in the race of becoming the head of PPP. A few landlords in the Central Executive Committee (CEC) of the party also supported him. However, Niazi failed and finally, he left the PPP and framed the National Progressive Party in 1978.⁷⁷

70 *Kawish Mag* (Weekly) May 04, 2014.

71 *Daily Musawaat*, August 2, 1979.

72 Khoso, *Kari Kakar Haith Mon Jhaidaindai Chadiya*.

73 *Kawish Mag* (Weekly) May 11, 2014.

74 Ahmad, *Struggle for Democracy*, 85.

75 Sheikh, *Benazir Bhutto Jedojehad Jee Aalamat*.

76 Bhatti, *MRD Tahreek*.

77 Maulana Kausar Niazi, *Aur Line Cut Gai* [Urdu: And Line Cut Off] (Lahore: Jang Publication, 1987).

Niazi, Jatoi and Pirzada held secret meetings with General Zia to fail the campaign against the military government.⁷⁸ Moreover, they had ideological differences which continued for a long time from 1977-1988.⁷⁹ The rightists in the party were *pirs* and industrialists. They had important portfolios and socialists such as Sheikh Muhammad Rasheed could not gain major seat in the party.⁸⁰ The friends of Bhutto like J. A. Rahim (the first Secretary General of the PPP), Dr. Mubashar Hassan (co-pioneer of the PPP) and Malik Mairaj Khalid (Law Minister in Bhutto government) had already left the party due to divergences with the policies of Bhutto.⁸¹ During the final phase of Bhutto, space and hold had been given to Nawab Sadiq Hussain Qureshi, Ghulam Mustafa Khar, Jam Sadiq, Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi, Mumtaz Bhutto and General (r) Tikka Khan. However, most of them abandoned the party when time of trial began.⁸² General Zia intimidated political leaders of the PPP and put them under house arrests. The government restricted intra-provincial movement of party workers, and this created communication gap among common workers and leadership.⁸³

Sheikh Rasheed accused the moderate leaders Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi and Farooq Leghari of rifting the party after the arrest of Bhutto.⁸⁴ Concurrently, Nusrat Bhutto could not convince the moderate leadership of the party because of her refusal for a political agreement with the government. If political deal was done with Zia, the life of Bhutto would have been saved.⁸⁵ Due to Bhutto's effort for nuclear programme, non-violent resistance to save Bhutto lacked international

78 Aijaz Ahmed, "The Rebellion of 1983: A Balance Sheet", *South Asia Bulletin* IV, no. 1 (1984): 35.

79 Ahmed, "The Rebellion of 1983", 36.

80 Ahmad, *Struggle for Democracy*, 86-87.

81 *Kawish Mag (Weekly)*, March 23, 2014.

82 Ahmad, *Struggle for Democracy*, 87.

83 Ghafoor Ahmad, *Zia Ke Akhri Dus Saal* [Urdu: Last Ten Years of Zia] (Lahore: Jang Publishers, 1993).

84 *Viewpoint*, June 24, 1979, 15.

85 Sheikh, *Benazir Bhutto Jedojehad Jee Aalamat*.

support. Apart from these reasons, there were internal conflicts within the party that became main cause of the failure of the movement.

The daily *Jang* also reported that American officials warned Bhutto for quitting nuclear programme.⁸⁶ Ian Talbot explains that the US government was also fearful of Bhutto's quest for taking Pakistan towards Islamic socialism.⁸⁷ Due to the Soviet invasion in Afghanistan, Washington supported unconstitutional government in Pakistan to preserve their vested interest in the region. Not only United States but other international forces also supported the Martial Law. Resultantly, peaceful resistance to save Bhutto could not gather the desired foreign support.⁸⁸

Apart from lacking international support, a great majority of the political parties of Pakistan also opposed the anti-government movements.⁸⁹ The daily *Jang* reported that the Martial Law in Pakistan was welcomed by most of the political parties.⁹⁰ The Save Bhutto Movement was resisted because Bhutto isolated and damaged political image and influence of many people such as feudal lords, religious leaders, tribal chiefs and capitalists.⁹¹ Moreover, Bhutto's policies regarding land reforms and nationalization also affected big landlords and business community of the country.⁹²

86 Niazi, *Aur Line Cut Gai*, 167-69.

87 Ian Talbot, *Pakistan; A Modern History* (London: Hurst & Company Publishers Ltd., 1998), 245.

88 Ian Talbot, *Pakistan*, 246.

89 Ahmed, *Zia Ke Akhri Dus Saal*.

90 Daily *Jang*, July 15, 1977. Also see Mushahid Hussain's Interview on MRD Movement, *Kawish News Channel* April 15, 2014.

91 Iftikhar H. Malik, *State and Civil Society in Pakistan: Politics of Authority, Ideology and Ethnicity* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1997), 92.

92 *Kawish Mag (Weekly)*, March 23, 2014. Husain, *Pakistan's Politics*, 115. Rizvi, *Military, State and Society in Pakistan*, 180.

Conclusion

The hanging of Bhutto and public reaction to this came on a perceived injustice which indicates strong connection between theory and practice of non-violence on the Save Bhutto Movement. Dictator Zia used violence to suppress public reaction, but failed to silence the opposition. The government failed to prove any case against Bhutto. Thus, when he was arrested on fabricated charges, public reaction was high and uncontrolled. From five tactics of backfire, four tactics failed to inhibit public outrage against government. However, the use of official channels succeeded to end the chapter of Bhutto and he was finally sent to gallows. In this regard, this study points out a clear connection between theory and practice of non-violence and reflections of backfire on the Save Bhutto Movement.